

May 11, 2017 Job Number: 2186-004 Historical Resource Evaluation for 4208 New York Avenue, Glendale, CA 91214

## MEMORANDUM FOR THE RECORD

2.6 2186-004 M01

TO: Zohrabians Architects and Builders

(Mr. Patrick Zohrabians)

FROM: Sapphos Environmental, Inc.

(Ms. Alexandra Madsen and Ms. Carrie Chasteen)

SUBJECT: Historical Resource Evaluation for

4208 New York Avenue, Glendale, CA 91214

ATTACHMENT: 1. Resumes of Key Personnel

## **EXECUTIVE SUMMARY**

At the request of the City of Glendale (City) and Mr. Patrick Zohrabians, a prospective applicant, Sapphos Environmental, Inc. conducted an evaluation of 4208 New York Avenue, Glendale, Los Angeles County (AIN 5606-013-063), to determine if the subject property meets the definition of a "historical resource" as defined in Section 15064.5(a) of the California Environmental Quality Act (CEOA) Guidelines. In order to inform this evaluation, a site visit was conducted on May 4, 2017, by Sapphos Environmental, Inc. (Ms. Alexandra Madsen). Project coordination was led by Ms. Carrie Chasteen. Ms. Madsen and Ms. Chasteen meet the Secretary of the Interior's Professional Qualification Standards in the fields of History and Architectural History. The 2011 North Glendale survey of residences located within the City's northern neighborhoods was reviewed, and research was conducted in building permits, Assessor records, city directories, and the Internet. The purpose of this research was to determine if the property meets the criteria for being determined eligible for listing in the California Register of Historical Resources (CRHR), as articulated in Section 15064.5(a)(3) of the CEQA Guidelines, and/or for designation as a City Historic Resource. The property was not evaluated for inclusion in the National Register of Historic Places per the City's guidance. The evaluation concluded that the property does not possess sufficient historical or architectural significance to merit listing in the CRHR or City Register of Historic Resources. Because 4208 New York Avenue does not appear eligible for listing in the CRHR or City Register, it is not considered to be a "historical resource" as defined in Section 15064.5(a) of the CEQA Guidelines.

## **Corporate Office:**

430 North Halstead Street
Pasadena, CA 91107
TEL 626.683.3547
FAX 626.683.1745

## **Billing Address:**

P.O. Box 655 Sierra Madre, CA 91025

Web site:

www.sapphosenvironmental.com

## INTRODUCTION

At the request of the City of Glendale (City) and Mr. Patrick Zohrabians, a prospective applicant, Sapphos Environmental, Inc. conducted an evaluation of 4208 New York Avenue, Glendale, Los Angeles County (AIN 5606-013-063), to determine if the subject property meets the definition of a "historical resource" as defined in Section 15064.5(a) of the California Environmental Quality Act (CEQA) Guidelines. This memorandum for the record (MFR) documents these identification and evaluation efforts.

In order to inform this evaluation, a site visit was conducted on May 4, 2017, by Sapphos Environmental, Inc. (Ms. Alexandra Madsen). Project coordination was led by Ms. Carrie Chasteen. Ms. Madsen possesses a Bachelor of Arts in History from Saint Anselm College (2014) and a Master of Arts in Art History from the University of Texas at Austin (2016). Ms. Madsen meets the Secretary of the Interior's *Professional Qualification Standards* in the fields of History and Architectural History. She has more than four years of experience in the field. Ms. Chasteen possesses a Bachelor of Arts in History from the University of South Florida (1997) and a Master of Science in Historic Preservation from the School of the Art Institute of Chicago (2001). Ms. Chasteen meets and exceeds the Secretary of the Interior's *Professional Qualification Standards* in the fields of History and Architectural History. She has more than 15 years of experience conducting surveys, research, evaluating properties, and preparing regulatory compliance documents (Attachment 1, *Resumes of Key Personnel*).

The 2011 North Glendale Historic Context was reviewed to determine how the subject property compares with the buildings documented and evaluated as part of that effort. Research was conducted using reliable information available through public and nongovernmental agencies, libraries, and other sources of published information including:

- Los Angeles County Assessor;
- City of Glendale Building and Safety, building permits;
- City of Glendale Public Library, city directories;
- Historical issues of the Los Angeles Times; and
- Internet.

The purpose of this research was to determine if the property meets the criteria for being determined eligible for listing in the California Register of Historical Resources (CRHR), as articulated in Section 15064.5(a)(3) of the CEQA Guidelines:

- A. Is associated with events that have made a significant contribution to the broad patterns of history and cultural heritage;
- B. Is associated with the lives of persons important in our past;
- C. Embodies the distinctive characteristics of a type, period, region, or method of construction, or represents the work of an important creative individual, or possesses high artistic value; or
- D. Has yielded, or may be likely to yield information important in prehistory or history.

-

City of Glendale, California. 19 November 2011. *North Glendale Historic Context*. Accessed May 5, 2017. Available at: http://www.glendaleca.gov/government/departments/community-development/planning-division/historic-preservation/historic-preservation-ordinances-community-plan-historic-contexts

The property was also evaluated for designation as a City Historic Resource. The City Historic Resource eligibility criteria mirror the CRHR with the addition of resources that exemplify the early heritage of the City (Criterion E). Research was conducted to determine if the subject property exemplifies the early heritage of the City for designation as a City Historic Property. The property was not evaluated for inclusion in the National Register of Historic Places per the City's guidance.

## **HISTORY**

The Crescenta Valley of Los Angeles County includes portions of Sunland, Tujunga, Glendale, La Canada, and La Crescenta that are located between the Verdugo and San Gabriel mountains. The area of La Crescenta-Montrose was a part of the Mexican land grant given in 1843 by Governor Manuel Micheltorena to schoolteacher Ygnacio Coronel, of Pueblo Los Angeles. In 1798, the land became a part of the 36,000-acre Rancho San Rafael established by Don Jose Verdugo. Pickens Canyon in La Crescenta is named after one of the community's first settlers, Colonel Theodore Pickens. The area was largely initially developed as a residential community between 1870 and 1920.<sup>2</sup>

Only some portions of La Crescenta-Montrose remain in unincorporated Los Angeles County, as regions of the once-larger community have been annexed into the City of Glendale. The property at 4208 New York Avenue is one such annexed lot. Together, the community of La Crescenta-Montrose represents 3,437 square miles of the Rancho San Rafael land consolidation. The community's motto is "The Balcony of Southern California," referring to its 1,500-foot elevation (the Verdugo Mountains and Angeles National Forest foothill boundaries are claimed to range "to 2,700 feet").<sup>3</sup>

The Glendale Improvement Society was formed in 1883, and the name "Glendale" was formally adopted in 1884. By 1887, the new community was platted and registered with Los Angeles County. The Glendale Improvement Society became inactive shortly thereafter but was revitalized in 1902 when Glendale was connected to the City of Los Angeles via the Pacific Electric Railway. The Pacific Electric Railway depot was constructed in 1906 and was located at the corner of Brand Boulevard and Broadway, approximately 9 miles from the subject property. With the ability to commute to Los Angeles for work and shopping, development in Glendale grew at a rapid pace including residential buildings, schools, and churches.<sup>4</sup>

The property at 4208 New York Avenue was annexed to the City of Glendale as part of the New York Avenue annexation of January 28, 1952. The New York Avenue annexation extended the City's boundary north to the base of the San Gabriel Mountains and enhanced the city's tax base. <sup>5</sup>

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>2</sup> Crescenta Valley Chamber of Commerce. "About La Crescenta." Accessed May 2017. Available at: http://www.crescentavalleychamber.org/about-la-crescenta

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>3</sup> Crescenta Valley Chamber of Commerce. "About La Crescenta." Accessed May 2017. Available at: http://www.crescentavalleychamber.org/about-la-crescenta

Galvin Preservation Associates. 2007. City of Glendale Reconnaissance Survey and Historic Context Statement of Craftsman Style Architecture 2006–2007 Certified Local Government Grant.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>5</sup> City of Glendale, California. 19 November 2011. *North Glendale Historic Context*. Accessed May 5, 2017. Available at: http://www.glendaleca.gov/government/departments/community-development/planning-division/historic-preservation/historic-preservation-ordinances-community-plan-historic-contexts

## PROPERTY OWNERSHIP AND OCCUPANCY

The current owner of the subject property is Robert de Steunder. The property has had multiple owners and occupants between 1924 and 1977. However, prior to annexation by the City of Glendale, occupants were not recorded in the Glendale Directories; the property first appeared in the 1954 Polk's Glendale City Directory. A summary of the history of previous occupants and owners of the property was compiled from readily available public records (Table 1, *Summary of Ownership History*).

TABLE 1
SUMMARY OF OWNERSHIP HISTORY

Date	Occupant Identified in Glendale City Directories <sup>6</sup>	Los Angeles County Assessor Ownership Record
1921	No Entry	Southern California Edison Company <sup>7</sup>
1922	No Entry	
1923	No Entry	
1924	No Entry	
1925	No Entry	
1926	No Entry	Emmaline Hutchinson <sup>8</sup>
1927	No Entry	
1928	No Entry	
1929	No Entry	
1930	No Entry	
1931	No Entry	Charles J. Wood <sup>9</sup>
1932	No Entry	
1933	No Entry	
1934	No Entry	
1935	No Entry	
1936	No Entry	
1937	No Entry	
1938	No Entry	
1939	No Entry	
1940	No Entry	
1941	No Entry	Ella Luentzel <sup>10</sup>
1942	No Entry	
1943	No Entry	
1944	No Entry	
1945	No Entry	
1946	No Entry	
1947	No Entry	Mary E. Holcomb <sup>11</sup>
1948	No Entry	
1949	No Entry	
1950	No Entry	

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>6</sup> Glendale City Directory Company, Glendale (1922–1949); Polk's Glendale City Directory, Glendale (1951–1977).

County of Los Angeles, Assessor Map Book 306, Page 85, 1921–1924.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>8</sup> County of Los Angeles, Assessor Map Book 453, Page 16, 1924–1930.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>9</sup> County of Los Angeles, Assessor Map Book 750, Page 19, 1930–1937.

County of Los Angeles, Assessor Map Book 750, Page 19, 1937–1944.

<sup>11</sup> County of Los Angeles, Assessor Map Book 750, Page 19, 1949–1953.

TABLE 1
SUMMARY OF OWNERSHIP HISTORY, Continued

	Occupant Identified in	Los Angeles County Assessor
Date	Glendale City Directories <sup>6</sup>	Ownership Record
1951	No Entry	
1952	No Entry	
1953	No Entry	
1954	Mary E. Holcomb	
1955	Mary E. Holcomb	
1956	N/A	]
1957	Mary E. Holcomb*	
1958	Mary E. Holcomb*	
1959	N/A	
1960	Mary E. Holcomb	
1961	N/A	]
1962	Mary E. Holcomb*	
1963	N/A	
1964	Mary E. Holcomb*	
1965	Mary E. Holcomb	
1966	N/A	
1967	No Return	
1968	Jack W. Van Derbur	
1969	Jack W. Van Derbur	William E. and Caroline M. Holcomb <sup>12</sup>
1970	Jack W. Van Derbur	
1971	N/A	
1972	Jack W. Van Derbur	]
1977	Wilbert J. De Steunder	Wilbert J. De Steunder <sup>13</sup>

**NOTE:** \*Denotes self-reported ownership of at least one occupant of the household.

## ASSOCIATED PERSONS

The original owner of the building was Emmaline Hutchinson. Charles J. Wood lived at the property in the early 1930s. Ella Luentzel was a housewife. <sup>14</sup> Mary E. Holcomb was a widow. <sup>15</sup> William E. Holcomb was a plumber. <sup>16</sup> Jack W. Van Derbur worked as a painter. <sup>17</sup>

No information was available on Emmaline Hutchinson, Charles J. Wood, or Wilbert J. De Steunder.

County of Los Angeles, Assessor Map Book 5606, Page 24A, 1959; City of Glendale, Plumbing Permit No. BB 79221, Issued on March 20, 1972.

County of Los Angeles, Assessor Intra-Net Records; On-File at Public Counter.

Ancestry.com. *California, Voter Registrations, 1900–1968* [database on-line]. Provo, UT, USA: Ancestry.com Operations Inc., 2017.

Ancestry.com. U.S. City Directories, 1822–1995 [database on-line]. Provo, UT, USA: Ancestry.com Operations, Inc., 2011

Ancestry.com. U.S. City Directories, 1822–1995 [database on-line]. Provo, UT, USA: Ancestry.com Operations, Inc., 2011.

Ancestry.com. U.S. City Directories, 1822–1995 [database on-line]. Provo, UT, USA: Ancestry.com Operations, Inc., 2011.

The property is located in Tract No. 5782 (0074-066), which was platted with Los Angeles County in 1923. The proprietor of this tract was G.C. Ward from the Southern California Edison Company.<sup>18</sup> This person and commercial enterprise are not known as early developers in Glendale and are not considered influential in the early development of Glendale.

## **BUILDING PERMIT HISTORY**

The original building permit was not available, although property improvements were first listed in the County Assessor files in 1924, likely the year the house was constructed. A number of plumbing permits list the owner as William Holcomb in 1967 and 1972,<sup>24</sup> and Wilbert J. De Steunder in 1975.<sup>25</sup> In 1990, the City sent two letters to owner Wilbert De Steunder, claiming that the property did not meet minimal aesthetic and health standards, and requiring the owner to paint the residence and garage and remove combustible materials from the yard.<sup>26,27</sup>

# **PROPERTY DESCRIPTION**

The one-story vernacular single-family residence is generally rectangular in plan. The building's original porch was partially enclosed at an unknown date, an alteration visible in the corner boards and above-grade concrete foundation. The primary entrance is a glass sliding door that is raised and situated in the corner of the enclosed porch; it is accessible via two concrete steps.

The cross-gabled roof is clad in composition shingles and has a partially-broken gable from where this addition was completed. The roof has overhanging eaves and narrow bands of vertical scalloped clapboard detailing along the upper recesses of the exterior. The building exterior is clad in wood clapboard siding with corner boards. Fenestration on the primary façade consists of two double-hung two-light windows with wood surrounds (Figure 1, *Primary Façade [Southern]*, 4208 New York Avenue).

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>18</sup> County of Los Angeles, Assessor Intra-Net Records; On-File at Public Counter.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>24</sup> City of Glendale, Plumbing Permit No. 19733, Issued on March 13, 1967; City of Glendale, Plumbing Permit No. 79211, Issued on March 20, 1972.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>25</sup> City of Glendale, Plumbing Permit No. 11132, Issued on February 27, 1975.

Brown, Lonnie. 24 April 1990. Letter to Wilbert De Steunder. RE: 4208 New York #4802-S.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>27</sup> Brown, Lonnie. 16 July 1990. Letter to Wilbert De Steunder. RE: 4208 New York #4802-S.



Figure 1. Primary Façade (Southern), 4208 New York Avenue SOURCE: Sapphos Environmental, Inc., 2017

The east and west secondary facades are in keeping with the design and materials of the primary façade. The west façade also has paired double-hung two-light windows with wood surrounds as well as a smaller aluminum casement window (Figure 2, Secondary Façade [Western], 4208 New York Avenue).



Figure 2. Secondary Façade (Western), 4208 New York Avenue SOURCE: Sapphos Environmental, Inc., 2017

The one-car at-grade detached garage is also in keeping with the design and materials of the residence and was likely constructed contemporaneous to the residence in 1924. The gable roof is clad in composition shingles and is accented with barge board. The exterior walls are clad in horizontal clapboard siding with corner boards and the original sectional garage is situated in the west façade.

Located on the lot is a pre-fabricated shed that was likely installed in the 1990s (Figure 3, Garage and Pre-fabricated Shed, 4208 New York Avenue).



Figure 3. Garage and Pre-fabricated Shed, 4208 New York Avenue SOURCE: Sapphos Environmental, Inc., 2017

# **Setting**

The building is situated in the center of a large, elongated residential lot that has little landscaping and is separated from an adjacent property with a stepped concrete wall. A small, roughly-built stone wall delineates the property's boundary along New York Avenue. The property is located within a residential neighborhood in Glendale, and the neighboring residences reflect a variety of architecture styles and periods (Figure 4, Facing North from 4208 New York Avenue and Figure 5, Facing South from 4208 New York Avenue).



Figure 4. Facing North from 4208 New York Avenue SOURCE: Sapphos Environmental, Inc., 2017



Figure 5. Facing South from 4208 New York Avenue SOURCE: Sapphos Environmental, Inc., 2017

## **EVALUATION**

Based upon a review of the historic context prepared for the North Glendale Historic Context, 28 previous ownership, and the construction history of this property, no historically significant events are known to have occurred at this site pursuant to Criterion A. Persons who made demonstrably significant contributions to the nation, state, or region are not known to be associated with this property pursuant to Criterion B. The residence is vernacular. The materials and design are not distinctive. The building is not known to be the work of a master and does not embody the distinct characteristics of a type, period, or method of construction pursuant to Criterion C. The building was constructed using common building materials and techniques, and the site was graded during construction of the building. Therefore, the property is not likely to yield significant information regarding the prehistory and history of the area pursuant to Criterion D. Additionally, the property was developed 40 years after the establishment of Glendale. The property was developed in 1924, and was not annexed into the City of Glendale until 1952. It was constructed 18 years after a period of rapid residential development that followed the establishment of the Pacific Electric Railway depot in Glendale in 1906, but was not considered a part of the City until 46 years later when annexed. Therefore, the property does not exemplify the early heritage of the City pursuant to Criterion E.

# **Integrity Considerations**

The setting of the property has been somewhat compromised: although it is largely surrounded by contemporary single-family dwellings. The addition of the Foothill Freeway (Interstate 210 West) drastically altered the view shed and feeling of the property. Moreover, the primary façade has an enclosed porch that altered the character of the building, creating a new sliding glass-door primary entrance. Therefore, the building does not retain integrity of design and feeling; however, it does retain integrity of materials, workmanship, association, and location.

The property located at 4208 New York Avenue does not possess sufficient historical or architectural significance to merit listing in the CRHR or City Register of Historic Resources.

## CONCLUSION

Because 4208 New York Avenue, Glendale, Los Angeles County, California, does not appear eligible for listing in the CRHR or City Register of Historic Resources, it is not considered to be a "historical resource" as defined in Section 15064.5(a) of the CEQA Guidelines.

Should there be any questions regarding the information contained in this MFR, please contact Ms. Carrie Chasteen at (626) 683-3547, extension 102.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>28</sup> City of Glendale, California. 19 November 2011. *North Glendale Historic Context*. Accessed April 19, 2017. Available at: http://www.glendaleca.gov/government/departments/community-development/planning-division/historic-preservation/historic-preservation-ordinances-community-plan-historic-contexts





# Alexandra I. Madsen, MA

#### Architectural Historian

Master of Arts, Art History, University of Texas at Austin, Austin, TX, 2016

Bachelor of Arts (Magna Cum Laude), History, Saint Anselm College, Manchester, NH, 2014

- Cultural resources management and legal compliance
- Identification and evaluation of the built environment
- Archival documentation
- Historic preservation consultation

Years of Experience: 5

- Phi Alpha Theta
- Pi Gamma Mu
- Architectural History
- Cultural History
- Fluent Spanish

Ms. Alexandra Madsen, Architectural Historian for Sapphos Environmental, Inc., has more than five years of experience in the field of cultural resource management including experience in historic institutions, museums, and firms. Ms. Madsen has a Master's Degree in Art History from the University of Texas at Austin, where she focused on built environments. She meets and exceeds the Secretary of the Interior's *Professional Qualification Standards* in History and Architectural History.

Ms. Madsen has experience in completing cultural resources reports and in evaluating properties under federal, state, and local criteria. She has surveyed, conducted research on, and evaluated over 20 Los Angeles County Parks. This work includes archival research, identification and evaluation reports, and Department of Parks and Recreation (DPR) Series 523 Forms. Ms. Madsen has also evaluated education institutions for the Los Angeles Unified School District (LAUSD) as well as individual residential and commercial properties for various cities. This work required preparation of reports to demonstrate compliance with the Secretary of the Interior's *Standards for the Treatment of Historic Properties* (*Standards*), preparation DPR 523 series forms, and in some cases scoping for Environmental Impact Reports (EIR). She has worked on historic projects located throughout Los Angeles County. She is experienced with the Secretary of the Interior's *Standards* and CEQA compliance.

Ms. Madsen comes from a background specializing in historical and prehistorical artifacts and resources. She has worked in research, curatorial, collections management, and educational capacities. As a senior student assistant at the UT Dolphe Briscoe Center for American History, curatorial assistant at Gunn Memorial Historical Museum, and research intern at the Institute for American Indian Studies; Ms. Madsen was responsible for collections management and archival work. Moreover, she has participated in archaeological excavations in Orvieto, Italy and Warren, Connecticut.

Ms. Madsen is a member of the National Trust for Historic Preservation, L.A. Conservancy, Pasadena Heritage, and the Association for Latin American Art.



# Carrie E. Chasteen, MS

## Senior Historic Resource Specialist

Master of Science (Historic Preservation), School of the Art Institute of Chicago, Chicago, Illinois, 2001 Bachelor of Arts (History and Political Science), University of South Florida, Tampa, Florida, 1997

- Cultural resources management and legal compliance
- History of California
- Identification and evaluation of the built environment
- Archival documentation
- Historic preservation consultation

Years of Experience: 14

- Oregon Transportation Investment Act (OTIA) III CS3 Technical Lead
- Historic Preservation Commission, City of Pasadena
- Phi Alpha Theta
- Architectural History
- Cultural History

Ms. Carrie Chasteen has more than fourteen years of experience in the field of cultural resources and the built environment, including project management, agency coordination, archival research, managing large surveys, preparation of compliance reports, preparation of Environmental Impact Statement / Environmental Impact Report (EIS/EIR) sections, peer review, and regulatory compliance. She meets and exceeds the Secretary of the Interior's professional qualification standards in the fields of History and Architectural History.

Ms. Chasteen has served as Principal Investigator / Principal Architectural Historian on projects in Kern, San Bernardino, Riverside, Ventura, Los Angeles, Orange, Imperial, and San Diego counties in Southern California. She has experience in California, Oregon, Washington, Arizona, Nevada, Missouri, Illinois, Florida, West Virginia, Connecticut, New York, New Jersey, and Massachusetts. She has extensive experience with the California Office of Historic Preservation, the California Department of Transportation (Caltrans), San Bernardino Associated Governments (SANBAG), Los Angeles County Department of Parks and Recreation, the City of Los Angeles, and various state, county, and local government agencies.

Carrie Chasteen served as Principal Architectural Historian for the Interstate 10 (I-10) Corridor Project. For this project, Caltrans, in conjunction with SANBAG, proposes to improve the I-10 corridor by adding lane(s) and providing improvements along all or a portion of the existing 33-mile stretch of I-10 from approximately 2 miles west of the Los Angeles/San Bernardino county line in the City of Pomona to Ford Street in the City of Redlands. She provided consultation services for the Arcadia County Park Pool and Bathhouse Replacement Project, which included documenting and evaluating the park as a historic district for eligibility for inclusion in the National Register of Historic Places and the California Register of Historical Resources. Because the park was found to be eligible for listing in both registers, Ms. Chasteen provided additional consultation services to ensure the replacement pools and bathhouse were incompliance with the Secretary of the Interior's Standards for the Treatment of Historic Properties in order to minimize potential impacts to the historic district. Additional experience includes preparing Historic American Building Survey/Historic American Engineering Record (HABS / HAER) documentation for the former Caltrans District 7 headquarters building, Roosevelt Annex at the California Veterans' Home in Yountville, and the Space Flight Operations Facility, commonly referred to a Mission Control, a National Historic Monument, at the let Propulsion Laboratory (IPL) in Pasadena.

Carrie Chasteen is a member of the Society of Architectural Historians, National Trust for Historic Preservation, California Preservation Foundation, and Pasadena Heritage. Ms. Chasteen is also a Historic Preservation Commissioner for the City of Pasadena.